## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS EASTERN DIVISION

IN RE: UNIFIED MESSAGING \$ MDL No. 2371 (ALL CASES)

SOLUTIONS, LLC \$ Master Docket No. 12 C 6286 (ALL CASES)

Hon. Joan H. Lefkow

\$ \$ \$ \$ \$

## MOTION FOR JUDGMENT ON THE PLEADING THAT THE '141, '306, '313, AND '148 PATENTS ARE UNENFORCEABLE

The undersigned Defendants respectfully move this Court for judgment on the pleadings that the '141, '306, '313, and '148 patents-in-suit are unenforceable, and for dismissal of those cases in which UMS has only asserted such unenforceable patents. In those cases where the Defendants are also accused of infringing other patents, the Defendants respectfully request that the '141, '306, '313, and '148 patents be dismissed from those actions as unenforceable.

As grounds for this motion, which are more fully set forth in the Memorandum in Support of Defendants' Motion for Judgment on the Pleadings filed contemporaneously herewith, and incorporated herein by reference, Defendants state as follows:

- 1. The patentee promised the Patent Office, via terminal disclaimers, that four of the patents-in-suit, U.S. Patent Nos. 7,836,141 ("the '141 patent"), 7,895,306 ("the '306 patent"), 7,895,313 ("the '313 patent"), and 7,934,148 ("the '148 patent") (collectively, the "Terminally Disclaimed Patents"), would be "enforceable only for and during such period that it and the prior patents are commonly owned." These terminal disclaimers extend to any grantee, successor or assignee, and therefore, bind UMS.
- 2. UMS claims to be the exclusive licensee with "ownership of all substantial rights" to the patents-in-suit, making it the owner-in-fact of the Terminally Disclaimed Patents.

- 3. One prior patent subject to the disclaimers is U.S. Patent No. 6,350,066 ("the '066 patent"). As such, the '066 patent must also be commonly owned by UMS, otherwise the Terminally Disclaimed Patents are unenforceable.
- 4. UMS has repeatedly and consistently insisted that it has no ownership interest in the '066 patent. During the May 23, 2013 *Markman* Hearing, UMS disavowed any ownership of the '066 patent.
- 5. Rather, the '066 patent is owned by Advanced Messaging Technologies, Inc. ("AMT"), a different party that, as UMS made clear, has no privity with UMS. AMT has consistently claimed that it "owns by assignment, the entire right, title and interest in and to the '066 Patent' in separate patent infringement action in the Central District of California.
- 6. Because the '066 patent is not owned by UMS, the party holding ownership of the Terminally Disclaimed Patents, the Terminally Disclaimed Patents are unenforceable as a matter of law.

WHEREFORE, Defendants respectfully request that the Court enter judgment on the pleading that the '141, '306, '313, and '148 patents are unenforceable, and accordingly dismiss all cases in which UMS has only asserted such unenforceable patents.

Dated: July 3, 2013	Respectfully submitted,
	By: /s/ Kal K. Shah Kal K. Shah
	THOMPSON COBURN LLP
	55 East Monroe Street
	Chicago, IL 60603
	Tel: 312.580.2338
	KShah@thompsoncoburn.com
	Anthony F. Blum
	THOMPSON COBURN, LLP
	One US Bank Plaza

5764256.1 - 2 -

St. Louis, MO 63101 Tel: 314.552.6291

ablum@thompsoncoburn.com

## Attorneys for Defendant ORBITZ, LLC

By: /s/ Deanna R. Swits

Deanna R. Swits (Ill. Bar No. 6287513)

dswits@nixonpeabody.com

Jason T. Kunze (Ill. Bar No. 6300271)

jkunze@nixonpeabody.com

Nixon Peabody LLP

300 South Riverside Plaza, 16th Floor

Chicago, IL 60606

Telephone: 312-425-3900 Facsimile: 312-425-3909

Jason C. Kravitz (Mass. Bar No. 565904)

(admission pro hac vice to be requested)

jkravitz@nixonpeabody.com

Nixon Peabody LLP 100 Summer Street

Boston, MA 02110-2131 Telephone: 617-345-1000

Facsimile: 617-345-1300

Attorneys for Defendant STATE STREET CORPORATION

By: /s/ Lee F. Johnston

Lee F. Johnston (admitted pro hac vice)

Email: johnston.lee@dorsey.com

Case Collard

Email: collard.case@dorsey.com

DORSEY &WHITNEY LLP

1400 Wewatta Street, Suite 400

Denver, CO 80202

Telephone: (303) 629-3400 Facsimile: (303) 629-3450

Attorneys for Defendant AMERIPRISE

FINANCIAL INC.

By: /s/ Rick L. Rambo

Rick L. Rambo, Lead Attorney

State Bar No. 00791479

rrambo@morganlewis.com

Thomas R. Davis

State Bar No. 24055384

tdavis@morganlewis.com

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 4000

Houston, Texas 77002

713.890.5000 Telephone 713.890.5001 Facsimile

Attorneys for Defendant CEQUEL COMMUNICATIONS,

By: /s/ M. Dru Montgomery

J. Thad Heartfield

(Texas Bar No. 09346800)

M. Dru Montgomery

(Texas Bar No. 24010800)

THE HEARTFIELD LAW FIRM

2195 Dowlen Road

Beaumont, TX 77706

Tel: 409.866.3318

Fax: 409.866.5789

thad@ith-law.com

dru@jth-law.com

Attorneys for Defendants CONN'S, INC.

AND CONN APPLIANCES, INC.

5764256.1

LLC D/B/A SUDDENLINK	
COMMUNICATIONS	
Commenterinoris	
By: /s/ Thomas L. Duston	By: /s/ Thomas L. Duston
Thomas L. Duston	Thomas L. Duston
Paul B. Stephens	Kevin D. Hogg
Scott A. Sanderson	Scott A. Sanderson
MARSHALL, GERSTEIN & BORUN LLP	MARSHALL, GERSTEIN & BORUN LLP
6300 Willis Tower	233 South Wacker Drive
233 South Wacker Drive	6300 Willis Tower
Chicago, IL 60606-6357	Chicago, IL 60606-6357
Tel: 312.474.6300	Tel: 312.474.6300
tduston@marshallip.com	tduston@marshallip.com
pstephens@marshallip.com	khogg@marshallip.com
ssanderson@marshallip.com	ssanderson@marshallip.com
ssunderson e marshamp.com	ssunderson e marshamp.com
Attorneys for Defendant UNITED AIR	Counsel for Defendant GROUPON, INC.
LINES, INC.	
By: /s/ Jeffrey G. Mote	By: /s/ Galyn Gafford
Jeffrey G. Mote	Galyn Gafford
Matthew J. Levinstein	Michael Scott Fuller
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP	Roger B. Cowie
77 West Wacker Drive	LOCKE LORD BISSELL & LIDDELL LLP
Suite 3100	2200 Ross Avenue, Suite 2200
Chicago, IL 60601	Dallas, TX 75201-6776
T: (312) 456-8400 / F: (312) 456-8435	Tel: 214.740.8614
motej@gtlaw.com	Fax: 214.740.8800
levinsteinm@gtlaw.com	ggafford@lockelord.com
	sfuller@lockelord.com
Jerry Fellows	rcowie@lockelord.com
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP	
2375 East Camelback Road, Suite 700	Gregory Thomas Casamento
Phoenix, Arizona 85016	LOCKE LORD LLP (NYC)
T: (602) 445-8000 / F: (602) 445-8100	3 World Financial Center, 20th Floor
fellowsj@gtlaw.com	New York, NY 10001
	Tel: 212.415.8600
Attorneys for Defendant CUPID PLC.	Fax: 212.303.2754
	gcasamento@lockelord.com
	Attorneys for Defendants HSBC NORTH
	AMERICA
	HOLDINGS INC. AND HSBC USA
	INC./HSBC BANK
	USA, NATIONAL ASSOCIATION

5764256.1 - 4 -

/s/ D. Stuart Bartow By: /s/ Edward Pak Jeffrey Stone (SBN 6189590) **Edward Pak** Matthew Gryzlo (SBN 6243042) Email: edward@212media.com Amol Parikh (SBN 6285077) [212]Media, LLC MCDERMOTT WILL &EMERY LLP 460 Park Avenue South, 4th Floor 227 West Monroe Street New York, NY 10016 Chicago, Illinois 60606 Telephone: (646) 660-9436 Tel: 312.372.2000 Facsimile: (646) 349-4013 Fax: 312.984.7700 jstone@mwe.com Attorney for Defendant SPORTSVITE, LLC mgryzlo@mwe.com amparikh@mwe.com Yar Chaikovsky D. Stuart Bartow **Bryan James** McDermott Will & Emery LLP 275 Middlefield Road, Suite 100 Menlo Park, CA 94025-4004 (650) 815-7400 (650) 815-7401 - faxvchaikovsky@mwe.com sbartow@mwe.com bjames@mwe.com Counsel for Defendant YAHOO! INC. By: /s/ Henry Huang Henry Huang (admitted pro hac vice) By: /s/ Benjamin J. Bradford Ropes & Gray LLP Reginald J. Hill 700 12th St. NW Suite 900 Benjamin J. Bradford Washington, DC 20005 JENNER & BLOCK LLP (202) 508-4600 353 N. Clark Street henry.huang@ropesgray.com Chicago, Illinois 60654-3456 Tel.: (312) 222-9350 Attorney for Defendant Branch Banking and Fax: (312) 527-0484 Trust Company Attorney for Defendant BMO HARRIS BANK N.A. By: /s/ Beverly A. Marsh By: /s/ Jason M. Schwent Jeffrey S. Standley Jason M. Schwent F. Michael Speed, Jr. Thomas E. Douglass Beverly A. Marsh Anthony F. Blum STANDLEY LAW GROUP LLP THOMPSON COBURN, LLP 6300 Riverside Drive One US Bank Plaza

5764256.1 - 5 -

St. Louis, MO 63101 Dublin, Ohio 43017 Tel: (614) 792-5555 Tel: 314.552.6291 Fax: (615) 792-5536 Fax: 314.552.7291 jstandley@standleyllp.com jschwent@thomascoburn.com mspeed@standleyllp.com tdouglass@thompsoncoburn.com bmarsh@standleyllp.com ablum@thompsoncoburn.com Attorneys for Defendant HUMANA INC. Attorneys for Defendant SCOTTRADE, INC. By: /s/ Russell S. Jones, Jr. By: /s/ Norwood Jameson Russell S. Jones, Jr. (N.D. IL #30814) Rachael G. Pontikes (#6275709) POLSINELLI SHUGHART PC rgpontikes@duanemorris.com **DUANE MORRIS LLP** Twelve Wyandotte Plaza 120 W. 12th Street 190 South LaSalle Street Kansas City, MO 64105 Suite 3700 (816) 421-3355 Chicago, Illinois 60603 Fax No.: (816) 374-0509 (312) 499-6757 (Telephone) rjones@polsinelli.com (312) 277-6903 (Facsimile) Jay E. Heidrick L. Norwood Jameson (admitted pro hac vice) POLSINELLI SHUGHART PC (GA Bar No. 003970) 6201 College Blvd., Suite 500 Matthew C. Gaudet (admitted pro hac vice) Overland Park, KS 66211 (GA Bar No. 287789) (913) 234-7506 John R. Gibson (admitted pro hac vice) Fax No. (913) 451-6205 (GA Bar No. 454507) jheidrick@polsinelli.com wjameson@duanemorris.com mcgaudet@duanemorris.com irgibson@duanemorris.com Attorneys for SPRINT NEXTEL 1075 Peachtree Street NE, Suite 2000 **CORPORATION** Atlanta, Georgia 30309 (404) 253-6900 (Telephone) (404) 253-6901 (Facsimile) Attorneys For Defendants COXCOM, LLC AND EARTHLINK, INC. By: /s/ Lauren K. Schwartz By: /s/ Lauren K. Schwartz KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP Jeffrey G. Mote Brian D. Sieve, P.C. Matthew J. Levinstein Email: brian.sieve@kirkland.com GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP Craig D. Leavell 77 West Wacker Drive mail: craig.leavell@kirkland.com **Suite 3100** Lauren K. Schwartz Chicago, IL 60601 Email: lauren.schwartz@kirkland.com T: (312) 456-8400 / F: (312) 456-8435 motej@gtlaw.com 300 North LaSalle Chicago, IL 60654 levinsteinm@gtlaw.com (312) 862-2000

5764256.1 - 6 -

Attorneys for Defendant FIRST TENNESSEE BANK NATIONAL ASSOCIATION Jerry Fellows

GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP 2375 East Camelback Road, Suite 700

Phoenix, Arizona 85016

T: (602) 445-8000 / F: (602) 445-8100

fellowsj@gtlaw.com

Attorneys for Defendants FRIENDFINDER NETWORKS INC. AND VARIOUS, INC.

By: /s/ Timothy J. Carroll

**Howard Cabot** 

PERKINS COIE LLP

2901 North Central Avenue, Suite 2000

Phoenix, AZ 85012 Tel: 602.351.8000

Timothy J. Carroll Steven M. Lubezny PERKINS COIE LLP

131 South Dearborn Street, Suite 1700

Chicago, IL 60603 Tel: 312.324.8400

Manny Caixeiro

PERKINS COIE LLP

30 Rockefeller Center, 25th Floor New York, NY 10112-0085

Tel: 212.262.6900

By: /s/ Rick L. Rambo

Rick L. Rambo, Lead Attorney

State Bar No. 00791479 rrambo@morganlewis.com

Thomas R. Davis

State Bar No. 24055384 tdavis@morganlewis.com

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 4000

Houston, Texas 77002 713.890.5000 Telephone 713.890.5001 Facsimile

Attorneys for Defendant WINDSTREAM CORPORATION

Attorneys for Defendants THE VANGUARD GROUP,

INC. AND VANGUARD MARKETING CORPORATION

By: /s/ Rick L. Rambo

Rick L. Rambo, Lead Attorney

State Bar No. 00791479

rrambo@morganlewis.com

Thomas R. Davis

State Bar No. 24055384

tdavis@morganlewis.com

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 4000

Houston, Texas 77002 713.890.5000 Telephone By: /s/ Brian D. Roche

Brian D. Roche

Jennifer Yule DePriest

Reed Smith LLP

10 South Wacker Drive

Chicago, Ill 60606

Telephone: 312.207.1000 Facsimile: 312.207.6400

Email: broche@reedsmith.com

Email: jdepriest@reedsmith.com

5764256.1 - 7 -

713.890.5001 Facsimile	David T. Pollock (application to appear pro hac
Scott D. Sherwin	vice pending)
ARDC No. 6293788	Reed Smith LLP
ssherwin@morganlewis.com	101 Second Street, Suite 1800
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP	San Francisco, CA 94105-3659
77 West Wacker Drive, Suite 500	Telephone: 415.543.8700
Chicago, IL 60601	Facsimile: 415.391.8269
(312) 342-1789 Telephone	Email: dpollock@reedsmith.com
(312) 324-1001 Facsimile	
	Attorneys for Defendant GENERAL
Attorneys for Defendants PNC BANK, N.A.,	ELECTRIC CAPITAL SERVICES, INC.
AND RBC BANK (USA)	
By: /s/ Lisa K. Nguyen	By: /s/ Lisa K. Nguyen
Nicholas J. Siciliano	Nicholas J. Siciliano
LATHAM & WATKINS, LLP	LATHAM & WATKINS, LLP
233 South Wacker Drive, Suite 5800	233 South Wacker Drive, Suite 5800
Chicago, IL 60606	Chicago, IL 60606
Telephone: +1.312.777.7021	Telephone: +1.312.777.7021
E-Mail: nicholas.siciliano@lw.com	
	Matthew J. Moore
Richard G. Frenkel	(Admitted as Pro Hac Vice)
(Admitted Pro Hac Vice)	LATHAM & WATKINS, LLP
Lisa K. Nguyen	555 Eleventh Street, N.W., Suite 1000
(Admitted Pro Hac Vice)	Washington, D.C. 20004-1304
LATHAM & WATKINS, LLP	Telephone: +1.202.637.2278
140 Scott Drive	
Menlo Park, CA 94025	Clement J. Naples
Telephone: +1.650.328.4600	(Admitted as Pro Hac Vice)
E-Mail: rick.frenkel@lw.com	LATHAM & WATKINS, LLP
E-Mail: <u>lisa.nguyen@lw.com</u>	885 Third Avenue
	New York, NY 10022-4834
Attorneys for Defendant BANCORPSOUTH, INC.	Telephone: +1.212.906.1331
	Lisa Nguyen
	(Admitted as Pro Hac Vice)
	LATHAM & WATKINS, LLP
	140 Scott Drive
	Menlo Park, CA 94025
	Telephone: +1.650.470.4848
	Attorneys for Defendants GOVERNMENT
	EMPLOYEES INSURANCE COMPANY
	AND GEICO ADVANTAGE INSURANCE
	COMPANY
By: /s/ Steven J. Reynolds	/s/ D. Stuart Bartow
Steven J. Reynolds	Jeffrey Stone (SBN 6189590)

5764256.1 - 8 -

(Illinois State Bar No. 6293634) steven.reynolds@dlapiper.com

DLA PIPER LLP (US)

203 North LaSalle Street, Suite 1900

Chicago, Illinois 60601

T. 312.368.3467 F. 312.630.6352

John M. Guaragna (pro hac vice to be filed)

(Texas State Bar No. 24043308) john.guaragna@dlapiper.com

Brian K. Erickson (pro hac vice to be filed)

(Texas State Bar No. 24012594) brian.erickson@dlapiper.com

DLA PIPER LLP (US)

401 Congress Avenue, Suite 2500

Austin, Texas 78701-3799

T. 512.457.7000

F. 512.457.7001

Attorneys for Defendants AMERITRADE HOLDING CORPORATION AND TD AMERITRADE, INC.

Matthew Gryzlo (SBN 6243042)

Amol Parikh (SBN 6285077)

MCDERMOTT WILL &EMERY LLP

227 West Monroe Street Chicago, Illinois 60606

Tel: 312.372.2000 Fax: 312.984.7700 jstone@mwe.com

mgryzlo@mwe.com amparikh@mwe.com

Yar Chaikovsky D. Stuart Bartow

Bryan James

MCDERMOTT WILL & EMERY LLP 275 Middlefield Road, Suite 100

Menlo Park, CA 94025-4004

(650) 815-7400

(650) 815-7401 – fax

ychaikovsky@mwe.com

sbartow@mwe.com bjames@mwe.com

Counsel for Defendant TWITTER INC.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that all counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service are being served with a copy of this document via the Court's CM/ECF system on this 3rd day of July, 2013.

/s/ Anthony F. Blum
Anthony F. Blum

5764256.1